

---

## *Management Summary*

---

### Section I: Audit Objective, Scope, & Methodology

#### A. Introduction

We have completed our review of the City of Chesapeake Police Department (CPD) for the period September 3, 2019 to April 30, 2020. Our review was conducted for the purpose of determining whether CPD was providing services in an economical, efficient, and effective manner, whether its goals and objectives were being achieved, and whether it was complying with applicable City and departmental policies and procedures. The audit included a review and evaluation of procedures, practices, and controls of the various divisions of the CPD on a selective basis. All divisions of CPD, including Operations, Administrative, Emergency Communication Center, and Public Safety Training were subject to evaluation.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusion based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

CPD provided both emergency and non-emergency services for the City and its residents. CPD's primary services included enforcement of existing laws, testifying in court, responding to citizen concerns, transportation of apprehended individuals, animal services, and the promotion of crime prevention techniques and behaviors.

For Fiscal Year (FY) 2020, the Department had an operating budget of just over \$62.2 million. The budget was allocated over seven program areas with the Operations Bureau receiving almost \$34 million, Investigations Bureau just over \$12.3 million, and E911 Operations just over \$7.3 million. Other program areas included Administration (approximately \$3.2 million), Public Safety Training (approximately \$2.1 million), and Animal Services (almost \$2.7 million). CPD had an authorized complement of 401 sworn positions and approximately 182 civilian positions. These complement numbers have remained relatively unchanged over the last three budgets despite the City's increased population of over 16,000 citizens since 2015.

With the assistance of CPD, we identified performance information that was relevant to the department's operations. We also identified and addressed any additional problem

areas as requested by the CPD or determined from the audit itself. These areas included a review of staffing and retention issues, aging of the CPD vehicle fleet, and the condition of the Training Academy and other relevant facility needs.

## B. CPD Performance Information

The Department has grown from its early days when it was just several small sections to a department that is faced with a growing population, a large sprawling city, and environments ranging from airports, and industrial sites to swamps. The Department serves a city of 353 square miles and over 247,207 citizens (estimated and noted in the 2020 Budget.) The Department's core mission was "In partnership with the community, to promote a safe city through prevention of crime and enforcement of laws." The Department has met its operational goals by having five Precincts and a cadre of over 583 well trained and highly qualified police officers, dispatchers, and other professionals. The Department was responsible for responding to over 148,272 emergency calls during FY 2017-18.

### *1. Law Enforcement CALEA Accreditation*

The Police department earned its second CALEA accreditation award on July 26, 2017, effective over a four year period. The CALEA accreditation is the premier credential for public safety agencies which, when earned, demonstrates the organization's commitment to professionalism and adherence to standards promulgated by the board of CALEA commissioners. According to the CALEA Accreditation report, "the program is intended to enhance the organization service capacities and effectiveness, serve as a tool for policy decisions and management, promote transparency and community trust, and establish a platform for continuous review. CALEA Accreditation is the Gold Standard for Public Safety Agencies and represents a commitment to excellence."

### *2. Sworn Officer to Citizen Ratio*

CPD had the highest ratio of citizens per sworn officer in the region for 2019 (633). Of the eight cities that were compared in our study, Chesapeake had the fourth smallest complement of sworn officers even though it had the second largest population in 2019. Virginia Beach had the largest number of sworn officers but was second in the ratio of citizens per officer. The population sizes and sworn employee data included in this comparison were reported by the Virginia State Police and UVA Weldon Cooper Center for Public Service as of October 31, 2019.

### 3. Life in Hampton Roads Report<sup>1</sup>

The CPD fared favorably in a survey conducted by Old Dominion University. In 2018 the question was asked about whether or not citizens **trusted the local police**. CPD received a rating of 89.90% from those survey respondents who stated that they trusted the CPD a “great deal or somewhat.” This was the highest percentage of the seven Hampton roads cities. Virginia Beach came in second with a rate of 86.45% in this same category.

In 2016 the question was asked about the **level of satisfaction** with the local police. CPD had 93.3% respond that they were ‘very satisfied or somewhat satisfied’ with the CPD. This was the highest percentage of the seven Hampton Roads cities. The next city, Virginia Beach, was at 86.9%. However, the same question was asked in the 2017 survey and Chesapeake was third with an 84.7%. This was a drop of 8.6% from the prior year. In 2017 Virginia Beach was first with a positive response rate of 91.1% followed by Suffolk with 90.4%.

### 4. Organization

The Department was organized into three bureaus: Investigations, Operations, and Support.

- The **Investigations Bureau** included the Criminal Investigations Section, Vice and Narcotics Section, Criminal Intelligence and Gang Unit, Public Information Officer, and Crime Line Coordinator.
- The **Support Bureau** included Central Records, Public Safety and Emergency Communications Center, Ethics and Conduct Unit, Property and Evidence; Uniforms, Equipment, and Fleet Management, and the Law Enforcement Training Academy.
- The **Operations Bureau** included all five Police Precincts, the Special Operations Section, Crime Prevention Unit, Police Chaplain Unit, Special Weapons and Tactics Team (S.W.A.T.), Underwater Search and Recovery Team, Marine Patrol, Traffic Enforcement, K-9 Unit, Warrant Unit, Auxiliary Police, Animal Services Unit, Community Resources Unit, and the Police Explorers.

---

<sup>1</sup> The “Life in Hampton Roads Report” is the end product of an annual survey conducted by the Old Dominion Social Science Research Center (SSRC). The purpose of the survey was to gain insight into local citizens’ views and perceptions on the quality of life in Hampton roads and on various topics such as transportation, traffic, police, and education. Each year the questions changes so there was not a comparable question year to year.

## *5. CPD Precincts & Beats*

As of June 2020, the Department had five precincts to cover the 353 square miles of the City. These precincts were strategically located throughout the City to provide quick and responsive service. These precincts were further divided into police beats with 25 beats.

## *6. CPD Community Initiatives*

In addition to its core operational responsibilities, the CPD was involved in many community initiatives. We highlighted eight of them to show how the department has expanded its effort to reduce crime and educate the community about the CPD throughout the city.

## *7. Emerging Issue – Police Reform*

On June 8, 2020 Chesapeake experienced its largest peaceful protest in almost 50 years when hundreds of protestors marched down Cedar Road, from Mount Church, to the Chesapeake City Hall. The "March for Racial Justice", was put together by a newly formed coalition of black pastors. The march was to protest the death of George Floyd, while in the custody of the Minneapolis, Minnesota police. The march was part of a broader nationwide response that called for communities to review their police department's use of excessive force and the lack of accountability of police officers who use excessive force against citizens. Police departments were being asked to develop policies and procedures that minimized the potential for lethal force encounters, provide more oversight of police officers' behavior, and allow for more community based policing approaches. The CPD will have to address these concerns in the near future. (Letters from the Chief of Police and Mayor addressing this issue are included in Appendix B.)

## Section II: Findings & Recommendation

### C. Mental Health Crisis

While the CPD had peer support teams available to identify and provide the assistance available from peers, this situation still required better access to professional mental healthcare services that specialized in the needs of first responders in order to address hypervigilance and other common reactions caused by increased exposure to high stress emergency situations.

**Finding - The City did not have a focused work group nor a process in place to determine the adequacy of the EAP program and its professional mental health services for the City's first responders in the Police Department and other Public Safety departments. CPD has seen and continues to experience high employee turnover in law enforcement personnel resulting in mandatory overtime for the remaining police force and other emergency personnel.**

**Recommendation: CPD should continue its efforts through its Peer Support Team to provide peer support for CPD's first responders. In support of the CPD's Peer Support Program effort, the City should consider establishing a focused work group to develop and make recommendations to the Council for improving access to mental health care services for first responders.**

The focus group should be comprised of representatives that include, but are not limited to, the Police, Fire, and Sheriff Departments, Human Services and CIBH representatives, mental health professionals, Chesapeake Health Department, CISM and Peer Support leaders, and other state and local government officials. The focus group should consider strategically addressing:

- Disparities in access to mental health care and solutions to improve access at the departmental level
- Sufficiency of first responder mental health coverage
- Sufficiency of first responder organization human resource policies to support first responder mental health training
- The effectiveness of methods for assessing a first responder's mental health and any potential solution for identified issues
- Any specific barriers to first responder mental health access

## Response –

### Mental Health Crisis

The Police Department “agrees” with the Auditor’s findings with regard to Mental Health Crises. Over the years, it has become increasingly apparent to us that we fall short in prevention of mental health crises with Public Safety Personnel. Prevention includes assessing, treatment, and maintenance of personnel, who as a matter of operational and investigative functions, are exposed to various forms of trauma. The 21<sup>st</sup> Century Policing Report clearly advises that it is of paramount importance to protect the mental health and well-being of police officers.

At the direction of the City Manager, the Process Improvement Officer has formed a team to identify the best practices for delivery of mental health services to Public Safety Personnel and other positions in City government that are exposed to trauma on a regular basis and those that experience incidents that rise to the fore where clearly some form of “trauma informed care” is appropriate.

## D. Staffing Challenges

The CPD was experiencing the consequences of high employee position turnover such as exorbitant overtime costs<sup>8</sup> and high worker’s compensation claims<sup>9</sup>. The high employee position turnover was creating staffing retention challenges mostly related to pay compression issues and a lack of a guaranteed step pay plan competitive with other neighboring localities and other public and private organizations.

**Finding: The CPD experienced 11 FT positions with a turnover rate in excess of 200%-300% over an eight year span beginning April 1, 2011 through October 13, 2019. Over the same time period the CPD had nine positions with a turnover rate in excess of 100%-191.67%. While all the CPD positions were mission critical to the operations of the department, turnover appeared to be most problematic within the FT Police Officers, Field Training Officers, Dispatcher 1 & 2 positions, Animal Control Officer 1 positions, FT Office Coordinator positions, VCIN OFC Systems Specialist positions, seasonal School Crossing Guard positions, as well as other positions with low complement sizes.**

The low retention resulted in a myriad of repercussions to both CPD civilian and sworn employees. An employee survey and a review of HR Clearance Forms completed by former employees brought out many issues that the CPD staff was experiencing as a

---

<sup>8</sup> \$11.9 Million in overtime from FY2015-FY2019 (averaging approximately \$2.4M per year from FY2015-FY2019)

<sup>9</sup> Approximately \$2.7M in worker’s compensation claims from FY2014 through FY2018

result of high employee position turnover. Some of these relevant issues included low employee morale, work-life balance issues caused by mandatory overtime, limited promotional advancement opportunities resulting in seasoned employees terminating their employment or retiring, loss of institutional knowledge, and increased risk of life or death to officers and citizens when undertrained officers with poor attitudes handled high risk encounters.

## *1. Summary Analysis of Position Turnover in the Police Department from April 1, 2011 through October 13, 2019*

Based upon our analysis, 63.47% of its positions experienced turnover with approximately 36% that did not experience any employee turnover over an eight year span from April 2011 through mid-October 2019. Of the 657 CPD occupied positions, 417 positions experienced turnover a total of 727 times. The overall turnover rate for the CPD was 110.65%. This turnover resulted in 5,112 months of temporary employment vacancies until positions were filled. Most problematic was the turnover in the frontline Police Officer positions and dispatcher positions that experienced temporary vacancies of 2,183 and 946 months, respectively. This was among other relevant police positions that were also analyzed. This situation was compounded by the fact that the CPD was operating with less than the number of budgeted sworn positions which created an undue hardship for the department.

## *2. Employee Retention Survey Results*

During 2020, Audit Services in coordination and cooperation with the CPD conducted two surveys of its employees for the purpose of determining what was need to improve employee retention within the CPD. One survey was addressed to the civilian employees of the department while the second survey was addressed to the sworn employees.

Survey Responses Analyzed:

- The surveys found that there was overwhelming support for such pay initiatives as **guaranteed pay increases at service milestones based on years of service** (94.32% Civilian and 99.6% Sworn) and **raising the entire salary scale for a position when it is necessary to raise starting salaries** (97.72 Civilian and 95.97% Sworn). Almost 90% of the Civilian responses also indicated that it was very important to them to know that their annual pay increases in a step plan was in place to allow for financial planning.

- Also of importance was the **opportunities for advancement** (88.64% Civilian) and pay increases for obtaining a college degree (62% Sworn). Tuition reimbursement was also of some significance to the civilian staff (57.95%)
- Both groups stated that **opportunities for professional development and increased training opportunities** was significant (78.16% Civilian and 85.08% Sworn).
- Sworn officers were also interested in **opportunities to temporarily work in a variety of units or assignments** (73.79%), **exploring different work schedules** (69.35%), and **relaxing the (5) continuous years requirement to (4) years as a sworn police officer with the CPD in order to participate in the Community Resident Vehicle program** (61.29%).
- However, **in a sharp contrast, both groups indicated that they did not favor opportunities for increased overtime hours** (37.50% Civilian and 42.74% Sworn).

The civilian and sworn survey respondents were able to provide their thoughts in a comments section at the end of the survey. The low retention resulted in a myriad of repercussions to both CPD civilian and sworn employees. An employee survey and a review of HR Clearance Forms completed by former employees brought out many issues that the CPD staff was experiencing as a result of high employee position turnover. Some of these relevant issues were highlighted below:

- There was low employee morale throughout the organization due to the constant turnover and the increased demand to absorb the added responsibilities of unfilled positions that the CPD was experiencing each year.
- Remaining employees were required to fill the vacancies with exorbitant amounts of mandatory overtime hours with little time to decompress, get the proper rest and exercise, and work-life balance in order to maintain a healthy mental and physical state.
- Staff was not always able to get vacation leave approved or develop themselves through professional developmental programs because of the low staffing levels.
- Staff had seen others end their employment with the CPD for promotional advancement opportunities in other agencies due to the limited ability to advance within the department.
- Staff had also seen others leaving for retirement due to undue physical and mental health and stress related issues.

- There was a loss of institutional knowledge when seasoned law enforcement police officers resigned from the CPD leaving less experienced officers to fill these vacant supervisory gaps.
- Employees were “training” at CPD and then leaving for more financially rewarding jobs with other local, state, and national police departments as well as with private security firms. When employees terminated their employment with the CPD, the City lost the training and on-going continuing professional education investment made in these former employees.
- Lower productivity, low morale, and high turnover placed both the officers and the citizens of Chesapeake at risk by potentially having under trained, officers with poor attitudes handling high risk encounters that could easily turn into life and death matters depending on how well the officers handle the situation.

This situation potentially placed both the officers and citizens in danger by increasing workforce injuries, increasing response times to emergency calls, decreasing the number of available officers that can respond to emergencies, and increasing the risks of depression and suicide brought on by hypervigilance and high stress levels that are typically found in law enforcement and other first responder positions. This situation also resulted in officers performing incompatible duties issues simply because there was not enough staff.

**Recommendation: The City Council in coordination with the City Manager is planning a compensation study to address the competitiveness of salaries and compression issues. Consideration should be given to evaluating both the civilian and sworn employees’ pay scales and benefits and restructuring them, as necessary, to remain competitive in the Hampton Roads market, both the civilian and governmental. We also recommend that the City develop a process that will allow the CPD as well as other city departments the ability to monitor position turnover and retention rates at the department level. The retention data could be used by CPD as a tool to monitor the staffing levels relevant to their department as future changes are made to address salary compression and benefits. The CPD should also continue monitoring the rate of answered and unanswered calls to monitor the efficiency and effectiveness of 911 citizen responses.**

CPD should also:

- Consider all of the comments and recommendations from the CPD law enforcement personnel’s retention surveys including, but not limited to,

- Working with the Central Fleet Management to consider relaxing the Community Residential Vehicle (CRV) Program from a five year commitment requirement to a lower requirement.
- Looking into alternative scheduling options to reduce the rotating shifts for officers, and improve court appearance scheduling to improve work-life balance, reduce overtime, and reduce the impact of officer fatigue;
- Improve opportunities for self-development and enhance advancement opportunities;
- Continue conducting *annual* surveys of its civilian and sworn staff to get the most timely and relevant feedback that would not normally be obtained from the normal chain of command;
- Hire sufficient staffing levels to allow officers to use more of their leave time for the proper rest that would allow them to continue their work efficiently and effectively.

## **Response –**

### Staffing Challenges

#### Partially Agree

The Audit Report correctly points out the high turnover rate of the “police officer and dispatcher” positions. These are our initial gateways to the organization. We expend a great deal of resources recruiting, screening, hiring and training people to be police officers and/or dispatchers. A recent report completed by the City’s Human Resources Department titled “FY 2019 Workforce AT A GLANCE” should be used to give a greater understanding of turnover within the Police Department.

We do our due diligence to ensure candidates who desire these critical positions are indeed mentally and physically fit to perform the essential tasks of the positions they are about to assume. We go so far as to offer ride-a-longs prior to hire, physical fitness workouts, and sit down and observe experienced dispatchers so they can get a feel for what lies ahead. We have also provided mentors, engaged family members to be supportive of their loved ones as they start a major life journey in law enforcement. Nevertheless, the job is complex, demanding, stressful, and dangerous. But it is also rewarding, enlightening, and never ending.

We lose most candidates early in the process, usually the first day or weeks of training and then throughout their probationary period which is 24 months. Once people make it through their probationary period, they are more likely to remain a member of the organization and go on to a long, rewarding career.

The same holds true for our dispatcher positions. Their job is complicated, demanding, stressful, and critical to our overall success. We make use of the latest the latest technology to help us manage and dispatch calls for service, but the interactions and communications with citizens who are experiencing extremely traumatic events is taxing on the people who deliver critical Public Safety Services.

The Audit Report references “Employee Retention Survey Results” which cites pay and advancement as issues that were the most important to people in the organization. The Department has worked closely with Human Resources to design and implement “Career Development” programs to create greater opportunities for different work assignments and compensation. The program’s design are desirable and achievable. However, all of these programs are limited by the available funding.

A close examination of the data included in the Audit Report who reveal that there is more than adequate opportunity for personnel to experience “lateral movement” to other assignments in the Police Department. Furthermore, we have recently instituted a “90 day assignment” to specialty units throughout the organization. We have increased opportunities for sworn personnel to work temporary assignments in specialty units and are determining the efficacy of lowering the 5 year hurdle for a CRV to 4 years. These action items are being done to increase retention and job satisfaction.

## E. Challenges of an Aging Police Fleet

We analyzed CFM Fleet records pertaining to the CPD vehicles to determine the condition of 100% of CPD’s active vehicle fleet inventory as of December 20, 2019. There were a total of 415 items included on CPD's active vehicle equipment list as of 12/20/2019. Audit Services’ scope included reviewing data collected on 414 CPD active vehicles. CPD’s active fleet includes models dating back as early 1998<sup>10</sup> to 2019. We noted that the CPD fleet was experiencing an increase in obsolescent vehicles.

**Finding - CPD’s active Fleet was growing obsolete at a faster pace than the rate at which it was being replaced. As of June 2020 our analysis showed that CPD was experiencing exorbitant repair costs to maintain an aging fleet – resulting in an avoidable financial obligation in excess of \$1.5 million to repair and maintain obsolete vehicles.**

We noted that approximately 30% of CPD’s active fleet would have already been surplus and/or replaced if vehicles were rotated out of the fleet based on CFM’s targeted replacement dates. Seventy-nine of the 414 active vehicles in its fleet (19.08%)

---

<sup>10</sup> This range does not include the 1963 CPD historical vehicle used in parades.

with high mileage and excessive repair costs could have been classified as obsolete equipment. The 79 vehicles include 47<sup>11</sup> vehicles identified with excessive repair costs plus 32 vehicles with repair costs that were within 80% to 100% of the original purchase price. (The latter is an emerging issue.)

## 1. Analysis of the CPD Fleet

The data analyzed was provided by both the CPD Support Bureau and the CFM. Data pertaining to original cost, replacement dates of vehicles, and work order detail were provided by CFM AssetWorks database with a cut-off date of 11/19/2019. Specialty equipment items (generators, boat equipment, etc.) and a confiscated vehicle #ES126 that was not maintained by the CFM were not included in this analysis. Vehicle ES126 was not included in the data reviewed for this reason.

The summary of findings for each analysis is provided below.

- **Mileage Analysis<sup>12</sup>.** Odometer readings from the active fleet included:
  - Sixteen (16) vehicles (3.86%) had mileage that exceeded 150,000 miles
  - One hundred and six (106) vehicles (25.60%) had mileage greater than 100,000 and less than or equal to 150,000.
  - The CPD fleet also included 292 vehicles with mileage less than 100,000 miles which made up 70.53% of the remaining active fleet.
- **Vehicle Replacement Analysis.** The data was reorganized to analyze recorded replacement dates. One hundred twenty-four (124) or 29.95% of the 414 active vehicles were still being used beyond Central Fleet's targeted replacement dates identified in the City's AssetWorks system by one or more years. The cut-off date used to measure the timeframe beyond replacement years was 11/19/2019. The period beyond the replacement years in this category ranged from a low of 1.42 years to a high of 15.03 years. (Note: The CPD's 1963 Ford vintage car (#E063) as well as two other vehicles (#E436 & #E195) did not include replacement dates documented in the CFM AssetWorks records).
- **Analysis of Vehicle Repair Costs.** The data was reorganized again from the perspective of cumulative repair costs. Forty-nine (49) of the 414 active vehicles (11.84%) had total repair costs in excess of the original purchase price of the vehicles. Almost \$1.5M was spend on repair costs for those 49 vehicles. The total of original prices was approximately \$1.2M with cumulative repair costs for those vehicles surpassing the original prices by a total of \$366,082.42.

---

<sup>11</sup> (37+9+1)

<sup>12</sup> Does not include equipment #ES126.

As a result, the CPD fleet was not being replaced in a timely manner despite a combination of indicative adverse assessments (such as high mileage, repair costs, depreciated values, diminishing returns, replacement dates, and equipment downtime) due to budgetary constraints, which hindered CPD from obtaining newer more efficient and effective vehicles. Additionally, the City experienced high repair costs to maintain a growing, aging fleet as the CPD was working to reposition emergency vehicles for full operational coverage.

A 2015 audit of the Fire Department found large apparatuses (such as Fire Engines and Ladder Trucks) not being replaced when the useful life of those assets were exhausted. This resulted in the Chesapeake Fire Department having to continue utilizing many obsolete vehicles for its Fire programs. CPD's Public Safety vehicles were experiencing the same issues in 2020 resulting in CPD having to continue utilizing many obsolete vehicles for its police programs. If this need is not addressed, the City will continue to experience high repair costs to maintain an aging fleet; and CPD and other public safety departments will continue to rely on high mileage, overtaxed vehicles that constantly battle mechanical breakdowns. Additionally, this situation will potentially endanger the officers who drive them as well as the citizens who rely on a timely response for emergency calls.

**Recommendation - The City should consider revising the Vehicle Replacement policy to require that first responder vehicles be replaced when the odometer reading reaches 100,000 miles or sooner if a vehicle is considered obsolete and the City continues to spend more money on repair costs than the vehicle's worth.**

The CPD should work with CFM to obtain summary information on the repair costs for each vehicle so that the CPD can monitor the costs of those repairs for replacement purposes. Additionally, with regard to risk management and safety, the City should consider allocating resources to allow CPD to upgrade safety features in PD cars such as automated braking that could be turned off if necessary but would be helpful in preventing front end collisions. Also, a device that monitors seatbelt use would be helpful to reduce worker's compensation claims. Risk Management met with the Deputy Chief and discussed non-seat belt use in some collisions a few months ago and a policy change was initiated by the Police.

## Response -

### Aging Fleet

Agree

The quantity and quality of our fleet has always ebbed and flowed with the prevailing financial conditions of the national economy. CFM continues to keep us apprised of the number of vehicles in our fleet and the overall condition of the vehicles. Up until the recent onset of the COVID 19 Pandemic, adequate funding was in place to dramatically improve the quality of our patrol vehicles despite the substantial increase in the costs of acquisition and up fitting of patrol vehicles.

The police department will continue to work closely with CFM and utilize allocated funding to replace older police vehicles as resourcefully as possible. Additionally, we will take advantage of modern technologies that make our police vehicles safer to drive and more reliable on the road. For example, our newest vehicles in the fleet are programmed with a seat belt usage enhancement option. All recent additions to the fleet have rear view cameras, reverse sensors and pre-collision assist systems built in. All advanced options come at a cost to the consumer and will add to the challenge of keeping up with our aging fleet. Worthy of repeating and of discernible concern, 30% of the police vehicle fleet has aged beyond targeted replacement dates. In these challenging times, our fleet must continue to be made a priority.

## F. Police Training Academy Facility Needs

We toured the Police Training Academy and identified significant problems with its physical conditions. These problems could violate OSHA standards as well as lead to mold, vermin, and other health related issues.

**Finding - The Police Training Academy facility lacked the necessary space and physical work environment needed for the staff and recruits. Additionally, the facility had reached the end of its useful life and was already showing signs of deterioration due to water damage caused by constant flooding, deteriorating structures, sink holes in the ground, and water in the underground storage beneath the parking lot.**

This situation also resulted from budgetary limitations. If not addressed, they could potentially endanger the health and safety of City personnel and Police and Sheriff recruits. Unabated mold has been known to contribute to respiratory ailments in humans including allergies and infections. Occupants utilizing the facilities were routinely exposed

to the mold and were potentially at risk. This situation also resulted in potential non-compliance with OSHA standards and guidelines.

**Recommendation: The City had plans to move forward on building a new training facility for all of its Public Safety Departments. We recommend that the City continue its efforts as funds become available and consider all of the Training Academy needs when planning and designing the new training facilities.**

With the increasing use of virtual meeting room technology during this COVID-19 pandemic (such as Zoom and Microsoft Teams), the city should reevaluate the need for physical meeting room spaces and spaces requirements for the Customer Call Center at the PSOC building. Possibly reconfigure the internal architectural design and the outdoor landscape to accommodate for indoor and outdoor running tracks and workout gyms and exercise spaces. As an option, the design could include the installation of modular walls similar to those used in hotel ball rooms to size rooms based on need. The design should also address the need for adequate administrative and instructor offices, class rooms with computing and printing capabilities, space for scenario/practical training, adequate lunchroom facilities, adequate bathroom and locker room facilities, and appropriate storage for all of the Public Safety departments and the City's new recruits. Consideration should also be given toward how other public recreation centers and private organizations (such as the YMCA and other gyms) have laid out their buildings and parking for more efficient and effective maximum utilization of space when designing plans for all of the City's Public Safety Training Academy needs. If parking limitations becomes an issue consider making remote parking at other City owned locations available with regularly scheduled bus trips. This would allow recruits to be transported to and from these remote locations to the PSOC building.

Until the new facility is constructed CPD and the Sheriff's Office should coordinate with Facilities Maintenance to address the existing issues to the extent feasible. Such action could help to mitigate some of the health and safety risks faced by employees at the facility.

## G. Other Relevant Facility Needs

We identified additional facility needs for the Police Headquarters, Evidence Room, and Vice and Narcotics Section

**Finding - The Police headquarters building and evidence room had space limitations, and some Vice and Narcotics Section space needed maintenance and a safe.**

Police staff needed adequate facilities to proper complete their assigned

duties. We identified the following space concerns for CPD:

- **The Public Safety CPD Headquarters 1<sup>st</sup> Precinct Employee Space Limitation.** The 1<sup>st</sup> precinct did not have enough space for its employees. An observation of the facilities showed several rooms where employees, desks, and computers were living and existing in cramped quarters. There was also not enough space to place room dividers for privacy for these workers.
- **Storage Needs for the Evidence Room.** Audit Services also observed the evidence room and note a lack of storage space as the CPD Evidence room staff were at the mercy of the Commonwealth Attorney's office and other layers of Law Enforcement to authorize the destruction or release of items in the evidence room.
- **Facility Needs for Vice & Narcotics Section.** The Vice & Narcotics Division facility was also in need of flooring and weather stripping for the police officers using the facility. The property was being leased by the CPD at an undisclosed area. The lease required CPD to be responsible for all of the interior while the landlord was responsible for the exterior. The lease also required the CPD to maintain liability insurance as part of the lease. Also, confidential funds used to make drug purchases was only secured in a locked filing cabinet within a locked room.

**Recommendation - The City should place a priority in addressing all of the facility needs to address space limitations in the 1<sup>st</sup> Precinct and Evidence Room. Consideration should also be given to reconfiguring the unutilized space where the City's original 911 Call Center was located and incorporating that space into the plans of the new architectural design of the Public Safety Building.**

The City should move forward with its Capital Project plans for the expansion of the Police Evidence Room to address the space needs. With regard to the Vice & Narcotics Division location, the City should renegotiate the lease agreement to lower the rent in order to use funds in order to make the necessary repairs. Otherwise, relocate the Unit to another location. Finally, more security such as a dual controlled safe and security cameras should be placed over the confidential funds stored in the facility.

### **Responses to both F and G –**

Police Training Academy Facility Needs

Agree

At present, the City has engaged a vendor to review, analyze and recommend replacement, renovations and upgrades to both the Public Safety Building and Chesapeake Law Enforcement Training Academy. Both of these facilities are in excess

of 40 years old and require substantial capital to address present and future needs. Replacement and/or renovations to these critical facilities must occur soon. As the Audit Report indicates, the 1<sup>st</sup> Precinct is in dire need of renovation and additional space. The Evidence Storage Facility is nearly reaching capacity as the laws governing both records and evidence retention have changed which require longer retention times.

With regard to the securing of confidential funds by Vice and Narcotics, a more robust means of security has been implemented.

# FY2020 CPD PERFORMANCE AUDIT

## SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS

18,542

No. of Chesapeake Crimes in FY2019 Reported to the VA State Police

110.65%

Overall CPD Employee Position Turnover Rate (4/1/2011 through 10/13/2019)

\$11.9M

CPD Overtime Costs associated with staff retention issues (FY2015-FY2019)

16

No. of CPD Vehicles with mileage that exceeded 150,000 miles.

\$1.5M

The City's financial obligation already made to repair & maintain obsolete vehicles for the CPD Fleet

1941

The year the Dept. of Defense built the Administrative Training Building

### MENTAL HEALTH CRISIS

While the CPD had peer support teams available to identify and provide the assistance available from peers, this situation still required better access to *professional* mental healthcare services that specialized in the needs of first responders in order to address hypervigilance, depression, and other common reactions caused by increased exposure to high stress emergency situations.

- The City did not have a focused work group nor a process in place to determine the adequacy of the EAP program and its professional mental health services for the City's first responders in the Police Department and other Public Safety departments.
- If timely access to mental health of the City's Law Enforcement personnel is not addressed, this situation will continue to worsen as the City continues to experience excessive increases in emergency calls involving such things as increased occurrences of domestic violence and substance abuse during this Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic.

### STAFFING CHALLENGES

The high employee position turnover was creating staffing retention challenges within the CPD mostly related to pay compression issues and a lack of a guaranteed step pay plan competitive with other neighboring localities and other public and private organizations.

The CPD experienced:

- 11 FT positions with a turnover rate in excess of 200%-300% over an eight year span beginning April 1, 2011 through October 13, 2019.
- 9 FT positions with a turnover rate in excess of 100%-191.67% for the same time period.

While all the CPD positions were mission critical to the operations of the department, turnover appeared to be most problematic within the following position titles: FT Police Officers, Field Training Officers, Dispatchers 1 & 2, Animal Control Officers 1, FT Office Coordinators, VICIN OFC Systems Specialists, seasonal School Crossing Guards, as well as other positions with low complement sizes.

Consequences experienced:

- Low employee morale,
- Exorbitant amounts of mandatory overtime hours with little time to decompress creating work-life balance issues.
- Overtime costs totaled \$11.9M (FY15-19 averaging \$2.4M per year. High worker's compensation claims was \$2.7M over the last five years.
- Better promotional advancement opportunities in other agencies due to limited advancement opportunities within CPD.
- Loss of institutional knowledge when seasoned employees resigned.
- Potential for increased risk of injury and even death to officers and citizens resulting from lower productivity, low morale, and high turnover when less experienced officers are not prepared to deal with high risk encounters.

### AGING OF THE POLICE VEHICLE FLEET

CPD vehicle fleet is growing obsolete at a faster pace than the rate at which it is being replaced. The data was showing that CPD was experiencing exorbitant repair costs to maintain an aging fleet – resulting in an avoidable financial obligation in excess of \$1.5 million to repair and maintain obsolete vehicles. Consequences to retaining an aging fleet:

- 16 vehicles (3.86%) had mileage that exceeded 150,000 miles.
- 106 vehicles (25.60%) had mileage greater than 100,000 and less than or equal to 150,000.
- 37 CPD police vehicles exceeded the useful life of the vehicles with cumulative repair costs that exceeded original purchase prices.
- 9 CPD vehicles that had not yet exceeded their useful life but had repair costs that have already exceeded purchase prices.
- 32 additional vehicles had cumulative repair costs that will exceed their original purchase prices within the near future (Emerging Issue).
- If the City does not address the urgent need to replace police vehicles timely, the City will continue to drive repair costs up to maintain an aging fleet; and the CPD, as well as other public safety departments will continue to rely on high mileage, overtaxed vehicles that constantly battle mechanical breakdowns. Additionally, this situation will potentially endanger the lives of the officers who drive them as well as the citizens who rely on a timely response for emergency calls.

### AGING OF THE POLICE & SHERIFF TRAINING ACADEMY

A site visit of the Police Training Academy found that the current facilities on the premises did not accommodate for the necessary space and physical work environment needed for the staff and recruits. Additionally, the facilities had reached its useful life and was already showing signs of deterioration due to water damage.

- The building was built in 1941 by the Department of Defense. In 1972 the City took over the building. The building is lower than the surrounding fields and parking lot. As a result, the building has and will continue to experience flooding and damage caused by hurricanes and a steady increase in annual rainfall.
- There was no evidence within the City to show that air quality tests were occurring annually.
- Police and Sheriff share the training center. The class sizes have grown and are larger than the facility can withstand. Police have four coordinators who coordinate the limited room space, cafeteria space, bathroom breaks, etc.
- City placed a berm (a dirt mound) around the perimeter of to support the surrounding fields which is higher than the building itself. The City continues to spend good money over bad to repair ongoing water damage to the facilities.

### 1<sup>ST</sup> PRECINCT, EVIDENCE ROOM, VICE & NARCOTICS

- The 1<sup>st</sup> Precinct was also experiencing space limitations, overcrowded offices, & needed repairs.
- Evidence Room was experiencing storage limitations.
- Vice & Narcotics facility was leased and also in need of upgrades throughout. More security was needed over the confidential funds used to make drug purchases stored in the facility.